Open Letter to the Office of the Attorney General of the Republic of El Salvador on the Santa Marta Five and the Criminalization of Environmentalists, From Academics and Lawyers Across the Globe

We write as academics and lawyers from across the globe who work in solidarity with the Salvadoran people to promote social and environmental justice, and who are gravely concerned about the criminalization of environmentalists, the systematic violation of human rights, and the flagrant undermining of democracy in El Salvador perpetrated under the ongoing State of Exception.

Many of us who have worked with and/or been inspired by the Salvadoran social movements for social and environmental justice were appalled by the arrest and detention of five Water Defenders from the department of Cabañas on January 11, 2023. The people arrested—Miguel Ángel Gámez, Alejandro Laínez García, Pedro Antonio Rivas Laínez, Antonio Pacheco, and Saúl Agustín Rivas Ortega—helped lead the struggle to save El Salvador’s stressed water supply from the notoriously water intensive and polluting metals mining industry. They played a central role in the events that led the Salvadoran government to pass the historic, first ever national prohibition on metals mining in 2017.

A growing body of evidence shows that the case brought against the five Water Defenders by El Salvador’s Attorney General—for the alleged unlawful associations, alleged unlawful deprivation of liberty, and the alleged murder of a woman named María Inés Álvarez García Leiva on August 22 of 1989—is unsubstantiated by evidence, in violation of the National Reconciliation Law of 1992, in violation of the right to due process enshrined in the Salvadoran constitution, and likely politically motivated, as expanded on below.

**Lack of evidence:** Despite the seriousness of these criminal accusations, the Attorney General’s Office filed the charges without evidence. The charges rest entirely on the testimony of a protected eyewitness who later admitted under oath that they had no first-hand knowledge of the alleged crime. Strangely, the body of the alleged victim has never been found. Moreover, several of those charged have alibis during the time of her death.

**Lack of due process:** The lack of evidence has been compounded by a lack of due process. Once transferred to a permanent detention center, the five Water Defenders were not allowed to meet with their attorney to prepare for their defense for over six months. While the five were able to finally meet with their attorney upon being transferred to house arrest in September of 2023, this violation of the right to due process highlights the worrisome irregularities of this case.

**National Reconciliation Law:** In addition to the lack of evidence and due process, the charges against the five Water Defenders should never have been brought in the first place. This is because the five have been charged as FMLN combatants for their alleged acts during the civil war. As such, they are covered by the 1992 National Reconciliation Law, signed as part of the
Peace Agreement that granted amnesty to ex-combatants of the FMLN as a central element of the reconciliation and disarmament process that ended the civil war.

**Political Motivations:** Growing evidence suggests that this case against the Santa Marta anti-mining activists is neither random nor motivated by the Attorney General’s genuine pursuit of justice. Rather, community groups in El Salvador believe that the case was filed as part of the Salvadoran government’s larger political strategy to allow for the entry of metals mining to El Salvador in violation of the 2017 law. For example, in 2021, the Salvadoran government created a new public agency called the General Directorate of Energy, Hydrocarbons and Mines to regulate the energy and mining industry, and then joined the international pro-mining institution Intergovernmental Forum on Mining, Minerals, Metals and Sustainable Development. The selective violation of the National Reconciliation Law to muzzle key leaders of the anti-mining movement while stifling any meaningful attempt to bring the largest perpetrators of human rights violations during the civil war—the Salvadoran military—to justice is a telling sign of the political motivations behind this case. The current difficulties of the Salvadoran economy—exacerbated by the disastrous losses associated with the adoption of Bitcoin as a national currency—likely add to the government’s motivations to bring back metals mining and silence the Santa Marta water defenders.

The case of the Salvadoran Water Defenders has political stakes that go beyond the personal injustices perpetrated against the five accused. The politically motivated threat to El Salvador’s Water Defenders reopens the threat to Salvadoran’s democratically enshrined right to clean water and a country free of toxic metals mining. But the case is also emblematic of the broader violation of the human rights of those 70,000 plus Salvadorans detained under the current State of Exception without due process, of the ongoing political persecution of civil society organizations, labor leaders, and journalists who speak out against those human rights violations, and of the undermining of democracy.

In light of the lack of evidence, failure to ensure the right to due process, the amnesty granted under the National Reconciliation Law that followed the 1992 Peace Accords, and the troublesome political motivations to renew metallic mining against the will of the Salvadoran people, we the undersigned write to request that the Attorney General of the Republic immediately drop the case against the Salvadoran Water Defenders. We request that the Office of the Attorney General respect and enforce the human rights of all Salvadorans, including the right to due process and freedom of association.

*Signed by (university listed for identification purposes only)*

**Brazil**
Jose Dario Cordova Posada, Grupo Brasileiro de Pesquisas Sandor Ferenczi GBPSF  
Danilo Chammas, Ordem Dos Advogados do Brasil

**Canada**
Laura Macdonald, Carleton University  
Liisa L. North, Professor Emerita, York University, CERLAC
Dr. Jose Garcia, Futurewatch
Dr. Jose J Morales, MD, PhD
Juan Francisco Carranza Cisneros, Carranza and Associates
Shin Imai, Osgoode Hall Law School
Lisa Kowalchuk, University of Guelph
Dr. Catherine Nolin, University of Northern British Columbia (UNBC)
Giada Ferrucci, Western University
Dr. Paula Butler, Wilfrid Laurier University
Chris Vance, York University
Meera Karunanathan, Carleton University
Bernie Hammond, PhD, Professor Emeritus, Western University
Kirsten Francescone, PhD, Trent University
Valérie L'Heureux, Concordia University
Catherine Coumans, PhD

**Colombia**
Cindy Forero, Abogada del Cajar

**Costa Rica**
Emily J Yozell, Abogada
Patricia Alvarenga, Académica jubilada, Universidad Nacional, Costa Rica

**Denmark**
Dr. Vladimir Pacheco, Aarhus University

**Dominican Republic**
Dr. Laurent Ross, Universidad Tecnológica de Santiago

**El Salvador**
Saúl Baños
Mirna Antonieta Perla Jimenez
Andres McKinley, UCA
Omar Serrano, UCA
Ing. Andreu Oliva, UCA
Luis Rubén González, University of California, Merced
Xiomara Rodríguez, Terra Nuova
Rafael Paz Narváez, Universidad de El Salvador
Tomasa Elizabeth Fuentes Navarro, Asociación Americana de Juristas Rama El Salvador
Lic. José Vicente Cuchillas Melara, Universidad de El Salvador
MSC Óscar Canjura, Asociación Americana de Juristas Rama El Salvador
Jonathan Espinoza, UTEC
Maximiliano Omar Martinez, Abogado
Ariela González, Abogada
Sandra Elvira Rivera Cabrera, Abogada, Universidad de El Salvador
Juan Ayala, Abogado
Wily Alfonso Goitia Arze, UCA, Colproce
Lic. Luis Gonzalez

**England**
Grace Blakeley, Tribune Magazine
Dr. Marcus Colchester

**Finland**
Markus Kröger, Professor, University of Helsinki
Dr. Rauna Kuokkanen, University of Lapland
Teivo Teivainen, University of Helsinki

**Guatemala**
Victor Ferrigno, Abogado Constitucionalista, MadreSelva

**Ireland**
José Henríquez Leiva, University of Galway

**Italy**
Nora McKeon
Dr. John Gilbert, University of Florence

**Mexico**
Dr. Ignacio Román, ITESO, Universidad Jesuita de Guadalajara
Alberto Arroyo Picard, Universidad Autónoma de México – Ixtapalapa
Dr. Miguel Angel de los Santos Cruz, Facultad de Derecho
Dr. Hilary Goodfriend, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México
Jaime Mauricio López, Escuela Nacional de Antropología e Historia
Dra. Aideé Irina Tassinari Azcuaga, Universidad Autónoma de la Ciudad de México
Dr. Ernesto Aréchiga Córdoba, Universidad Autónoma de la Ciudad de México
Jorge Tripp, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México
Nina Torres, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana Xochimilco
Dra. Engracia Loyo Bravo, El Colegio de México

**New Zealand**
Dr. Pascale Hatcher, University of Canterbury

**Philippines**
Ma. Victoria R. Raquiza, PhD, University of the Philippines
Herbert Docena, PhD, University of the Philippines, Diliman

**South Africa**
Dr. Adrian Murray, University of Johannesburg
Spain
Dr. Ainhoa Montoya, Spanish National Research Council (CSIC)
Dr. Carlos Gómez Gil, Universidad de Alicante
Dra. Estrella del Valle Calzada, Universidad de Valencia
José Elías Esteve, Universidad de Valencia

Thailand
Sor. Rattanamanee Polkla, Lawyer, Community Resource Centre

United States of America
Dra. Mneesha Gellman, Emerson College
Dr. Paloma Martinez-Cruz, The Ohio State University
Diane Gifford-González, Distinguished Professor Emerita, University of California, Santa Cruz
Dr. Nicholas Copeland, Virginia Tech
Julio Gutiérrez, Universidad of North Carolina
Steven Rizzo, Harvard University
Lic. Elba E. Moreira
Ms. Maureen Brett, Retired Attorney
Jan Susler, Attorney
Constance Gordon, PhD, San Francisco State University
Ana Vieytez, University of California, Los Angeles
Ali Kaba, American University
Julia Fischer-Mackey, PhD, American University
Mellissa Linton Villafranco, PhD, Arizona State University
Janae Choquette, Esq., Attorney
Pamela Martin, Coastal Carolina University
Jorge Cuéllar, Dartmouth College
Caitlin Schroering, PhD, University of North Carolina at Charlotte
Mary Anne Perrone, Latin America Task Force of Interfaith Council for Peace & Justice
Dr. Camille-Mary Sharp, New York University
Eileen Weitzman, Attorney
Matthew Garr, PsyD student
Dr. Anne Reissner, Poverello House
Robert Andolina, Seattle University
Augusta Goldstein
Dr. Carlos Rivas, The Ohio State University
Katherine Borland, The Ohio State University
Zsea Bowmani, The University of Toledo College of Law
Rebekah Kaump, University of California, Davis
Nathanael Joseph, University of California, Irvine
Jackie Smith, University of Pittsburgh
Jamie de Moya-Cotter, University of Wisconsin-Madison
Victor Goldgel Carballo, University of Wisconsin, Madison
Sarah Ann Wells, University of Wisconsin, Madison
Nancy Escalante, Yale University
Enrique Rivera, PhD, University of California, Los Angeles
Jesse Broad-Cavanagh, Northeastern University School of Law
Dr. Fabian Romero, Ohio State University
Rev. John M. Caldwell, PhD
Dr. Antonio Ramirez, Elgin Community College
Gilbert Saucedo, Law Office of Gilbert Saucedo
Alejandra Watanabe Farro, University of California Santa Cruz
Richard Falk, Emeritus, Princeton University
Teresa A. Velásquez, PhD, California State University, San Bernardino
Angela Sanbrano, JD
Lucia Zamora Chamorro
Alexis Meza, New York University
Madeline Baer, Occidental College
Alfonso Gonzales Toribio, University of California Riverside
Yvette Borja, Esq. United States
Dr. Robin Broad, American University
Professor Jonathan Fox, American University
Professor Jesse Ribot, American University
Yansi Pérez, Carleton College
Joanna Beltrán, CUNY
Dr. E.J. Zita, Evergreen St. College
Dr. Michael Berghoef, PhD, MSW, Ferris State University
Patrick Murphy, IECA
Joanne E. Morrison, Attorney at Law
LaDawn Haglund, John Jay College
Dr. Sara Koopman, Kent State
Jacey Anderson, Montana State University
Dr. Molly Todd, Montana State University
Cheryl Trine, Attorney
Dr. Karen Melander-Magoon
Dr. Elana Zilberg
Dr. Ann Lutterman-Aguilar
John Gershman, NYU - Robert F Wagner Graduate School of Public Service
Kathy Glatz, retired professor
Prof. Katherine Cushing, San Jose State University
Dr. Tabitha Hart, San José State University
Alejandro Artiga-Purcell, San José State University
Costanza Rampini, San José State University
Manuel F. Montes, Society for International Development
Todd Davies, Stanford University
Lawrence Mosqueda PhD, Professor Emeritus, The Evergreen State College
Jeanne Hahn, Emeritus faculty, The Evergreen State College
Dr. Peter Bohmer, The Evergreen State College
Amy Argenal, University of California, Santa Cruz
Liza Grandia, University of California, Davis
Haejin Bang, University of California, San Diego
Leisy Abrego, University of California, Los Angeles
Valerie L Thatcher, PhD
Tina Shull, UNC Charlotte
Summer Lopez Colorado, University of California - Los Angeles
William I Robinson, University of California at Santa Barbara
Dr. Elana Zilberg, University of California San Diego
Nathan Edenhofer, University of California Santa Cruz
B. Richard Salas, University of California, Irvine
Stacy Philpott, University of California, Santa Cruz
Flora Lu, University of California, Santa Cruz
Steve Depoe, Professor Emeritus, University of Cincinnati
Miranda Cady Hallett, PhD, University of Dayton
Professor Andrew B. Reid, JD, LLM, University of Denver Sturm College of Law
Andrew Klapper, PhD, Professor Emeritus, University of Kentucky
Alessandro Morosin, University of La Verne
Dr. Mark Ginsburg, University of Maryland, College Park
Professor Gerald Epstein, University of Massachusetts, Amherst
Dr. Randall A. Lake, University of Southern California
Kat Williams, University of Texas at Austin
Christopher Helali, Vermont Law and Graduate School
Elizabeth O’Donnell Gandolfo, Wake Forest University School of Divinity
Dr. Christine Wade, Washington College
Elisabeth Jean Wood, Yale University
Manuela Picq, Amherst College
Ailesha Ringer, PhD, Metropolitan State University
Ching Ching Tan, San Jose State University
Marisol Lebrón, University of California, Santa Cruz
James K. Boyce, University of Massachusetts Amherst
Elja Roy, University of Memphis
Elizandro Umana, California State University, Los Angeles
Namiko Kunimoto
Rigo Fernandez
Diane L. Middleton
Mark Stern
John Blanco, University of California, San Diego

Organizations
Blue Planet Project, Canada
Socorro Jurídico Humanitario, El Salvador
Panorama Económico, El Salvador
Monitoring Committee on Attacks on Lawyers, International Association of People's Lawyers (IAPL), France
Transnational Institute, Netherlands
Katribu Kalipunan ng Katutubong Mamamayan ng Pilipinas, Philippines
American Association of Jurists (AAJ), United States
Central American Students Association, Harvard University, United States
Doctors for Global Health, United States
Foundation Earth, United States
Extractivism and Society Research Cluster, University of California Santa Cruz, United States
National Lawyers Guild - San Francisco Bay Area, United States
National Lawyers Guild, Task Force on the Americas, United States
Project South, United States